Reviewer's report

Title: Does Pomegranate intake attenuate cardiovascular risk factors in hemodialysis patients? Results of a randomized placebo controlled trial

Version: 1 Date: 28 October 2013

Reviewer: Juscelino Tovar

Reviewer's report:

1) Major Compulsory Revisions
1.1 The authors emphasize the apparent beneficial effect of PJ on several biomarkers, but in reality there was only limited statistical difference between the two treatments. It is true that the PJ-treated group exhibited improved SBP, PP, HDL and TG values when compared to baseline. However, only HDL (and barely TG) showed real differences in a between-treatment comparison, something that was not considered in the Discussion. The section must be modified in order to cover these issues.

1.2 No mention is made to the estimated discriminating power for variables other than SBP (page 5, third paragraph). How can the authors be sure that the lack of effect on the different outcomes was not influenced by insufficient statistical power?

1.3 The composition of the placebo juice must be reported in the Methods section.

2) Minor Essential Revisions
2.1 Please provide formal details regarding the approval by the ethics committee.

2.2 Page 5, fourth paragraph: the sentence “Patients who did not drink the juice at least 3 times per week were excluded” is confusing. Page 5, 2nd paragraph, states that 3 times/week was the programmed dose (page 5, 2nd paragraph). Is that correct? Did you allow greater doses?

2.3 Page 8, last paragraph: the “anti-atherogenicity properties” of PJ have not been mentioned before in the text. Please include this information in the Background chapter.

3) Discretionary Revisions
3.1 Page 8, paragraphs 1 and 2: Shouldn’t it read “Table 1” instead of “Table 2”?

3.2 Please correct typos in references 11 and 12 (page 13).

About statistics
The study followed a parallel design with markedly asymmetric arms. It would be convenient to hear the opinion of a statistician.
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests