Reviewer’s report

Title: Is drop-out from obesity treatment a predictable and preventable event?

Version: 1 Date: 18 November 2013

Reviewer: Yusuf Yilmaz

Reviewer’s report:

In the present study, the authors sought to investigate the main prediction of attrition in a sample of 98 adult obese patients undergoing a 6-month dietetic-behavioral weight-loss treatment. The main results indicated that psychopathological tracts (mainly hostility-anger), early dieting attempts, and a poor initial treatment response are key independent predictors of drop-out from obesity treatment. Overall, the paper is well-written and adds significant knowledge to the existing literature.

Minor Essential Revisions

1. Please use American vs British English spelling in a consistent manner throughout the paper.

2. Page 5, line 21. Please provide the manufacturer of "Dieta Ragionata 7.0".

3. Page 5, line 18. "0,5 to 1 kg/wk" should read "0.5 to 1 kg/wk".

4. Page 6, I suggest to describe the instruments (BES, SCL-90, BDI) in a specific paragraph.

5. The authors should clarify whether this is a convenience sample or whether they made some a priori hypothesis about the final sample size. If this is a convenience sample, the results may not be generalizable.

6. Hostility is a multifaceted construct encompassing affective, behavioral, and cognitive aspects. The role of anger-hostility as an independent predictor of drop-out needs to be discussed in greater detail. There are a number of reasons that high hostility may interfere with efforts to lose weight. First, cynicism may lead people to discount health-promoting messages regarding a range of health behaviors, including weight loss. In addition, cynicism and mistrust could undermine the therapeutic relationship between high hostile individuals and their weight loss counselors, which in turn could have a damaging effect on engagement in treatment. Finally, hostility may contribute to the likelihood of drop-out through its association with negative affect. These points need to be discussed as they may provide additional arguments for the discriminant predictive validity of the hostility construct.

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.