Reviewer’s report

Title: L-carnitine ameliorated fasting-induced fatigue, hunger, and metabolic abnormalities in patients with metabolic syndrome: a randomized controlled study

Version: 1 Date: 17 July 2014

Reviewer: Gustav Gustav Dobos

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

Review/Annotations according to the Consort Checklist:

Methods:

Trial design: Page 7. “In cases where severe adverse events occurred …… the participant was excluded from the study”. We believe you meant: “In cases where severe adverse events occurred ……, the participant had to stop the treatment and his data remained in the analysis.”

Participants: where did they stay during fasting: in the hospital or at home?

Outcomes: Neither in the Trial Registry nor in the study report you defined primary and secondary outcome parameters. We conclude that your study is a preliminary pilot study. Please mention that and state that the trial results are the basis for further confirmatory studies (under the chapters study design and limitations).

Sample size: how did you determine the sample size?

Randomization: please note what software you used. Allocation details are insufficient: please add ratio and concealment. Who generated and enrolled participants, who assigned to interventions?

Blinding: Who was blinded and how.

Results:

Please note for each group the number of participants who were analysed. As far as we can see, there were no drop outs. Please note.

Please define the period of the trial.

Discussion:

One emphasis lies on the perception of hunger and fatigue. You didn’t register the two items. Please explain

Review: according to the Consort Checklist:

Methods:
Trial design: Page 7. “In cases where severe adverse events occurred …… the participant was excluded from the study”. We believe you meant: “In cases where severe adverse events occurred ……, the participant had to stop the treatment and his data remained in the analysis.”

Participants: where did they stay during fasting: in the hospital or at home?

Outcomes: Neither in the Trial Registry nor in the study report you defined primary and secondary outcome parameters. We conclude that your study is a preliminary pilot study. Please mention that and state that the trial results are the basis for further confirmatory studies (under the chapters study design and limitations).

Sample size: how did you determine the sample size?

Randomization: please note what software you used. Allocation details are insufficient: please add ratio and concealment. Who generated and enrolled participants, who assigned to interventions?

Blinding: Who was blinded and how.

Results:
Please note for each group the number of participants who were analysed. As far as we can see, there were no drop outs. Please note.

Please define the period of the trial.

Discussion:
One emphasis lies on the perception of hunger and fatigue. You didn’t register the two items. Please explain

Minor Essential Revisions

Results:
Numbers analysed: In your tables you need to quote the number of participants for each group.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests’