Reviewer's report

Title: Outdoor exposure and vitamin D levels in urban children with asthma

Version: 1 Date: 20 February 2013

Reviewer: Leigh Newhook

Reviewer's report:

This is a well written interesting study. Minor essential revisions:

1) The cut-offs chosen for insufficiency and deficiency in this paper are not in keeping with the IOM recommendations from their 2011 report which found that based on the available literature the cut-off for 25(OH)D should be <20ng/ml and not <30ng/ml. The true cut-offs for extraskeletal outcomes, has yet to be determined, however using these cutoffs might be overestimating the degree of vit D insufficiency/deficiency. The authors should compare the results using the IOM cutoffs as well and comment.

2) Is there any explanation for no seasonal differences? comment

3) Do we know the rates of vitamin supplementation and milk consumption (is milk fortified) in this population? provide if available

4) There does not appear to be an association between degree of illness (ER visits and hospitalizations) and vit D concentration. Please comment.

5) There is no control group, a study limitation, therefore causation statements related to vit D insufficiency and asthma cannot be made. Please comment

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'