Reviewer's report

Title: Low fat intake is associated with pathological manifestations and poor recovery in patients with hepatocellular carcinoma

Version: 1 Date: 21 January 2013

Reviewer: Takehiro Okabayashi

Reviewer's report:

MAJOR COMMENTS
(1) This article was well written. However there are several problems in this paper.

(2) The major problem with this study is that it is entirely a small clinical trial. There is no way to know whether factors other than the low fat intake actually played a role in the results, because all patients could administered branched-chain amino acids. Authors should be discussed about the relationship between BCAA and low fat intake. Is only BCAA enough to control HCC patients with chronic liver diseases? Or are you thinking that low fat diet should be necessary?

(3) Also why and what kind of low fat diet supplementation did you use in this study?

(4) Authors sould be described about the mechanisms of improving patients status. Recently several reports were accepted about L-carnitine supplementation to diet as a new tool in treatmnet of chronic liver diseases. It might be co-related this study. So authors could be deicussed about this new comments.

MINOR COMMENTS
(1) Table 1 was very busy.

(2) Also Table 2 was busy.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.