Reviewer's report

Title: Perturbation of cellular immune functions in cigarette smokers and protection by palm oil vitamin E supplementation

Version: 2 Date: 20 May 2012

Reviewer: Kyu Rae Lee

Reviewer's report:

You mentioned ---to measure the effect of palmvitee supplementation on the immune status of smokers and nonsmokers by measuring the parameters of cell mediated immunity including lymphocytic activity--.

(1) How did you rule out the people who had taken diet including vitamin E such as special diet?

(2) What reason did you define those who have smoked for 5 years or more and 10 cigarettes or more as the smoker?

(3) The plasma levels of Tocopherol and Tocotrienol might not be different at between 12 and 24 weeks. Please let me inform why you monitored blood levels at 12, 24 weeks.

(4) What is the meaning the Cotinine to Creatinine ratio?

(5) Please describe why you chose Con A and PHA inducer cell T activity in 1:5 and 1:50 for the analysis.

(6) You mentioned one confounding factor such as gender on the discussion area. Name the other confounding factor on Vitamin E level in human.

(7) The numbers of subjects between measured plasma tocoperol and CCR at initial and 24th week were not consistent according to table 1. Please let me informed why they did. Did you find any significant result from drop-out subjects?

(8) The levels of lymphocytes according to the numbers of daily cigarettes would not be consistent with the amounts consumed cigarettes per day. I recommend that you should check the amount of nicotine expressed on the cover of tobacco packs, and reassess the levels of lymphocytes according to the consumed amounts of nicotine.

(9) Grammatically, “Different between smokers ---”should be replaced to “Difference between smokers ---”.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable
**Statistical review:** Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?