Reviewer's report

Title: Intermittent fasting combined with calorie restriction is effective for weight loss and cardio-protection in obese women

Version: 1 Date: 18 September 2012

Reviewer: Kazunori Ohkawara

Reviewer's report:

The purpose of this study was to examine the effects of intermittent fasting (IF) plus calorie restriction (CR) with a liquid diet (IFCR-L) on body weight, body composition, and the risk of coronary heart disease (CHD). Fifty-five obese women were randomly divided into IF CR-L group and IFCR without a liquid diet (IFCR-F) group for an 8-week weight loss intervention. As a result, body weight, fat mass, visceral adipose tissue and some CHD risk markers significantly decreased after the intervention in both groups. The authors concluded that a combination of intermittent fasting and calorie restriction using a liquid diet is an effective strategy to help weight loss and improving CHD risk in obese women.

The effect of intermittent fasting on obesity or chronic diseases is an interesting topic and further investigations should be needed by human studies. However, a major issue in this study is that this study design is difficult to clarify the effect of IF plus CR on weight loss or improving CHD risk compared to IF or CR alone. The authors could discuss effects of a liquid meal replacement on weight loss in this study. These effects were already reported in previous works as authors mentioned in the section of the introduction. Even if this study results compared to the results in previous studies which reported the effect of CR alone on weight loss, additional effects by IF plus CR do not seem to be found from this study.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests