Reviewer's report

Title: Weight Regulation: A review of the evidence supporting a paradigm shift

Version: 3 Date: 1 November 2010

Reviewer: Michelle Neyman Neyman Morris

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions
None noted

Minor Essential Revisions
1. Under Health at Every Size: A Review of Randomized Controlled Trials, first paragraph, second sentence. Although in this paragraph the authors refer specifically to RCT comparing HAES to conventional obesity treatment, it seems important to clarify somewhere in the manuscript that while “intuitive eating” has been used by some to advance size acceptance, others use the phrase as a “non-diet” approach to dieting, i.e., positing that if “overweight” people eat intuitively, they will (and should) naturally lose weight.

Discretionary Revisions
1. Abstract, consider replacing term trans-disciplinary with interdisciplinary

2. Under HEALTH AT EVERY SIZE: SHIFTING THE PARADIGM FROM WEIGHT TO HEALTH, paragraph one, consider adding 3) HAES philosophy on physical activity. Since “eat less, exercise more” is a common weight loss recommendation, it seems appropriate to address the HAES philosophy on physical activity in this article. Preliminary data from a convenience sample of nutrition/dietetics professors across the country collected by a graduate student in our lab suggests that professors consider “physical activity” a key component of weight regulation and among the top methods for weight loss and maintenance they teach to dietetics students.

3. Consider adding service mark SM when referencing Health at Every SizeSM

Minor issues not for publication
1. Under Assumption: Adiposity poses significant morbidity risk, paragraph four, sentence three, replace bodyfat with body fat.

2. Under Assumption: Anyone who is determined can lose weight and keep it off through appropriate diet and exercise, paragraph two, sentence one, replace Institute with Institutes (National Institutes of Health).

3. Under Assumption: Anyone who is determined can lose weight and keep it off through appropriate diet and exercise, paragraph two, sentence two, insert ‘A’ at beginning of sentence.

4. Under Assumption: Obesity-related costs place a large burden on the
economy, and this can be corrected by focused attention to obesity treatment and prevention, paragraph one, sentence three, replace ‘etc.’ with and socio-economic status.

In summary, this timely review article addresses the need to consider a paradigm shift away from traditional diet recommendations that focus on restriction and weight loss in order to address the “problem” of obesity. Given that results of such efforts are not sustained in the long term and the potential for unintended consequences, the authors argue convincingly for an evidence based approach to health promotion. The article is well written, supported by an extensive reference list, and makes a solid case for shifting health policy and practitioners focus from weight to health at every size. While the authors’ views may not represent the field as a whole, they are in fact arguing for a paradigm shift. This review will likely be of great interest to a wide range of professionals given that it addresses physical, mental, emotional and social determinants of health.

**Level of interest:** An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I am currently collaborating with lead author, Linda Bacon on HAES related research and writing projects. Therefore, I may be considered to have non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper.