Reviewer's report

Title: Effects of preoperative feeding with a whey protein plus carbohydrate drink on the acute phase response and insulin resistance. A randomized trial.

Version: 1 Date: 26 April 2011

Reviewer: Dan Waitzberg

Reviewer's report:

The authors present another fine contribution on their field of study, namely the shortening of fast time before surgery using distinct beverages containing carbohydrates and now whey protein.

One important issue to include in the manuscript is the number of register in the clinical trials org which is now considered mandatory for double blind studies.

Another important topic to include is if there was an external monitoring and auditing of the data collected.

There are some minor english misspellings that the authors can easily correct using the word processor.

At the randomization table it is seen that control group patients are significantly more in ASA II than the COP group. How this could have impacted the results?

In fact the authors choose to compare whey plus two different carbohydrates against water. Is seems more reasonable to have one group of only whey protein and water, and another with only the mixture of the starch and sucrose. How can we know that the results obtained would not be the same with only carbohydrates? The carbohydrate beverage used at the majority of studies is maltodextrin and not sucrose. How sucrose could have modified the insulin resistance, since it is much faster absorbed?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

No competing interests