Reviewer’s report

Title: Comparison of high protein and high fiber weight-loss diets in women with risk factors for the metabolic syndrome: a randomized controlled trial

Version: 1 Date: 6 January 2011

Reviewer: Penny Kris-Etherton

Reviewer’s report:

The authors conducted a timely study to compare diet high in protein (HP) with one high in fiber rich, minimally processed cereals and legumes (HFIB) to determine effects on weight loss after 8 weeks in 83 women participants. This is a proof of concept study. Participants on the HP diet loss more weight and total body fat compared with the HFIB diet. Diastolic blood pressure decreased more on the HP diet. This is a very interesting study and provides important information about the role of dietary protein in a weight loss study. The authors need to address the following points:

1. Since plant protein has been studied a great deal recently, the authors need to distinguish type of protein on the HP diet. It seems like, based on the methods, that the HP diet was largely from animal protein. Given this, this paper presents very new and important information which needs to be emphasized.

2. The authors need to cite the Sacks et al PoundsLost study.

3. The abstract should note how much energy intakes were restricted.

4. If possible, the abstract should include information on waist circumference.

5. The authors need to provide detailed information about the intervention they implemented.

6. References are needed for the measurements cited in the paper.

7. The authors need to discuss the limitations of their study, ie. that it was only an 8 week weight loss study.

8. In the discussion, a reference is needed for the meta analysis cited.

9. Please include page numbers.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests to declare.