Reviewer’s report

Title: Slum health: Diseases of neglected populations

Version: Date: 11 December 2006

Reviewer: Nicholas Freudenberg

Reviewer’s report:

General

This article addresses a vitally important public health issue and frames the questions appropriately. However, in order to be useful to other researchers, policy makers or advocates, the report needs additional depth and substance. Given the importance of the topic, the authors are encouraged to consider such revisions.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

The report should include a detailed profile of the health conditions in Salvador, an description of how this profile differs from that predicted by the health sector and an analysis of the causues of the discrepancy. These points are made in a few paragraphs but should be the heart of the article.

In addition, there should be a deeper analysis of the differences between what residents report versus developed country indicators(page 6) . Both reports should be compared to actual data on morbidity and mortality. By showing in the specific how different parties describe the problem, the authors can make a more persuasive argument.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare I have no competing interests.