Reviewer's report

Title: A community-based cluster randomized survey of noncommunicable disease and risk factors in a peri-urban shantytown in Lima, Peru

Version: 2
Date: 30 November 2013

Reviewer: Oliver Gruebner

Reviewer's report:

Summary
This is an important study on the burden of non-communicable diseases in a peri-urban slum in Lima, yet, along with the burden of accidents, a topic highly understudied in many slums of the world. The paper highlights the prevalence of depression and respiratory diseases in the slums and reports on related risk factors such as hypertension and obesity. Furthermore, the paper shows that smoking and alcohol abuse is more prevalent in males and observes an overall limited fruit consumption among the general population in the slum. The authors conclude that gender and age specific differences should be taken more into consideration when planning for health interventions.

However, this paper can be improved by applying a more advanced regression model with some additional explanatory variables besides age and sex. Furthermore, the results should be discussed not only in the Lima context but also in the context of other studies on health and the environment in the world’s slums. I highly encourage the authors to consider these additions and look forward to see the resubmission, which then would be what I believe a valuable and informative paper for policy support in both, the Lima context and in comparable settings worldwide.

-Major Compulsory Revisions

1. Please further specify your research goals at the end of the background section and/or clearly state your hypotheses. This would improve the readability of the text.

2. The statistical analyses should include more variables and/or adjustments for known risk factors. As you were looking at the three risk factors smoking, alcohol consumption and fruit/vegetable intake, you should consider adjusting your regression model for other (known) risk factors beyond age and gender, e.g., marital status, education level, occupation, migration status, access to water and sanitation, and/or housing quality, etc., which all were covered within the questionnaire. Please report model accuracies, significance levels and Odds ratios for the model. Even if you report that they have been tested but no significant association have been found, this would highly improve the informative content of the paper.
3. Please discuss your findings also in the context of other work on non-communicable diseases (diabetes, obesity, mental health, etc.) in other slums outside Peru. You might consider for example the work of MMH Khan et al. in Bangladesh.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests