Reviewer’s report

Title: More than just a cut: A qualitative study of penile practices and their relationship to masculinity, sexuality and contagion and their implications for HIV prevention in Papua New Guinea

Version: 2 Date: 24 April 2012

Reviewer: Leickness Chisamu C Simbayi

Reviewer’s report:

As acknowledged by the authors themselves medical MC is a major issue in the context of hyperendemic HIV situations in East and Southern Africa but not exactly so for PNG. While the manuscript is very interesting and represents an excellent piece of work, it's relevance for HIV prevention in PNG is still very limited. It is clearly medical anthropological work, it is in my view more appropriate for other journals such as Culture, Health and Sexuality; Masculinities; Medical Anthropology; International Journal of Men’s Health, Journal of Sex Research, Social Science & Medicine, etc.

The methodology chosen is appropriate but no limitations are highlighted. The analysis used did not apply theoretical saturation nor other concepts used in qualitative research such as trustworthiness (viz., credibility, dependability, transferability and conformability).

The results appear as some monologue under each type of MC without using sub-headings for the different themes or sub-themes.

The Discussion was rather limited in scope and could do with more explanations of the findings.

Finally, the authors have too many notes which is rather problematic when one is reading. They should keep them to a minimum.

In section below I chose option 3 for the sake of completing the review only.

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.