Author's response to reviews

Title: More than just a cut: A qualitative study of penile practices and their relationship to masculinity, sexuality and contagion and their implications for HIV prevention in Papua New Guinea

Authors:

Angela Kelly (a.kelly@unsw.edu.au)
Martha Kupul (martha.kupul@pngimr.org.pg)
Herick Aeno (herick.aeno@pngimr.org.pg)
James Neo (james.neo@pngimr.org.pg)
Richard Naketrumb (richard.naketrumb@pngimr.org.pg)
Lisa Fitzgerald (l.fitzgerald@sph.uq.edu.au)
Peter S Hill (p.hill@sph.uq.edu.au)
John M Kaldor (j.kaldor@kirby.unsw.edu.au)
Peter Siba (peter.siba@pngimr.org.pg)
Andrew Vallely (Avallely@kirby.unsw.edu.au)

Version: 3 Date: 29 May 2012

Author's response to reviews:

To the Editor,

Thank you for reviewing our paper “More than just a cut”. We have been pleased to be invited to make revisions based on your reviewers’ comments. We have addressed each one of them in the text where appropriate.

We attended to all of Dr Phanauphak’s minor essential revisions. Of Dr Phanauphak’s Discretionary Revisions we have also addressed all four of them.

As suggested by Dr Simbayi we have significantly reduced the notes by either including them in text or deleting them. We have included sub-headings under each of the different penile practices. We have now highlighted an important limitation of the study in the methods section and discussed data saturation. After careful consideration we did not alter the discussion section as we felt that we discussed the implications of the findings in great detail and believe that this is what we want to emphasise rather than re-examine the findings in the results section. We did not list the provinces in the table of penile categories, as we believe it would be misleading. For example we spoke to men in the National Capital District who did traditional initiation in West New Britain. Therefore we have continued to leave sites of where these practices were undertaken in the findings section.

We have also amended the document to ensure it is compliant with BMC International Health & Human Rights.
We hope we meet your requirements and look forward to a favourable recommendation.

Kind regards,

Angela