Reviewer's report

Title: Human-animal Chimeras for Vaccine Development: An Endangered Species or Opportunity for the Developing World?

Version: 2 Date: 20 January 2010

Reviewer: Laurie Zoloth

Reviewer's report:

The problem with the editorial is that its argument is based on historical inaccuracy. There is a long tradition in western folk and religious literature about chimeras in which they're not seen as monsters that are seen as possibilities. This includes werewolves and other shape changers.

In fact the theological implications of the medieval notion that humans can change shape and yet still remain human are a feature of both Jewish and Christian traditions. Eastern religions are not unique in the belief that human-animal mixtures can be normative, even powerful, and may be forces for good. Thus an argument based on a sharp distinction between cultures is problematic for it is not valid scholarship.

However, I am sympathetic to the intention of the authors. I believe that my point would help them in the basic idea, which is to allow chimeras for reasons of justice. That many religious traditions have textual resources for the claim makes the claim stronger.