Author's response to reviews

Title: Limitations on Universality: The "Right to Health" and the Necessity of Legal Nationality

Authors:

Lindsey N. Kingston (lnkingst@maxwell.syr.edu)
Elizabeth F. Cohen (efcohen@maxwell.syr.edu)
Christopher P. Morley (morleycp@upstate.edu)

Version: 3 Date: 5 May 2010

Author's response to reviews: see over
May 5, 2010

Re: Second Revision and Resubmission of MS 1369348375299156 - *Limitations on Universality: The "Right to Health" and the Necessity of Legal Nationality*

To the Editors of BMC International Health and Human Rights:

Thank you for allowing my co-authors and I to revise and resubmit MS 1369348375299156 for your consideration. We believe that we have incorporated all of the changes requested by the reviewers and required by the associate editor. Additionally, we have corrected other very minor typographical errors we identified in the last submission, and updated some other information as we believe appropriate. These changes include the following:

**In Response to Reviewer and Associate Editor Comments:**

*Response to Reviewer 1, suggestion for correction of references 23 & 52:*

References 23 and 52 have been altered. Note that in the original text, we utilized Refworks, and selected "BMC International Health and Human Rights" as the format. Please note also: References 23 and 52 have been altered to match a reference to a court decision we identified in another BMC IHHR article:


Decision citation in the Cook article which served as our model

We are happy to alter further if required. However, we believe the current citations match a similar citation type in the previous BMC IHHR article, with one exception. European Council on Social Rights proceedings are held in undisclosed locations, except to participants, to the best of our knowledge, so reference 52 does not include a city of decision.
Response to Reviewer 2, amendment of language in two sentences:

Sentence on Page 9 has been amended to read:

"Advocates of health rights – which include professional associations, intergovernmental organizations, networks of patients and human rights organizations, and prominent individual activists such as Paul Farmer - combine protections of the person (such as the right to refuse medical treatment or an occupying power’s responsibility to allow healthcare for citizens and prisoners of war) with social rights (such as the right to be provided the highest level of care attainable within one’s society) [15]."

Sentence on Page 13 has been amended to read:

"In his seminal essay, Marshall describes a historical evolution of citizenship since the 18th century, the trajectory of which culminates in the braiding together of civil, political, and social rights. Over the past half-century, this process unfolded in international law courts and venues." (Note also the additional clarifying sentence.)

Other corrections:

Page 5 - "22 results" in PubMed should have been 23; now corrected.

Page 9 - Spelling of "determinants" corrected.

Correction of reference on page 30 (former ref.63 is now a recite of 61)

Updated Author information to indicate Dr. Kingston's completed PhD

Updated acknowledgements to thank the reviewers, and to include a web reference to the SPARC program.

We look forward to your further consideration of this submission and, of course, are available to respond to any queries that may arise.

On behalf of my colleagues and myself,

Christopher P. Morley, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor & Vice Chair for Research,
Department of Family Medicine
Assistant Professor
Department of Public Health & Preventive Medicine
SUNY Upstate Medical University