Reviewer’s report

Title: Losing the genetic twin: donor grief after unsuccessful unrelated stem cell transplantation

Version: 1 Date: 20 October 2008

Reviewer: Eric M Yoshida

Reviewer’s report:

This is a very unique and interesting paper that can be easily generalized to other areas of transplantation, not just stem-cell transplantation, such as solid organ transplantation (ie. one can imagine that the donor families of cadaveric organ donors have similar experiences). The paper explores an area that is not well-known (ie. the emotional and psychological aspects of an unrelated donor) amongst physicians and allied health-care professionals and for this reason alone, the paper can be considered to be very interesting and important. I personally found this paper to be both very poignant and emotionally very powerful. After reading this paper, I felt that I gained a unique and profound insight into the emotional and psychological experiences of the unrelated donors. I also could not find any major faults or criticisms of this paper and the qualitative nature of some of the findings almost defied the conventions of clinical research. The methodology could be condensed with the actual survey questions summarized in an appendix or table and only a concise summary provided in the main text of the methodology section. Likewise, the description of the statistical analysis is provided twice within the body of the methodology and could be similarly summarized in a concise paragraph. There are also some sentences that are “awkwardly” written throughout. These, however, are very minor critical comments and in general, my impression of this paper is highly favourable.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests with this paper.