Reviewer's report

Title: Selecting effective incentive structures in health care: a decision framework to support health care purchasers in finding the right incentives to drive performance.

Version: 1 Date: 30 October 2007

Reviewer: Søren Holm

Reviewer's report:

General

This is a very comprehensive and thoughtful critical review of the link between incentive structure and performance improvement and clearly adds significantly to the literature in this field.

It is well structured and well written.

I am slightly sceptical as to whether the account of the specific policy context in which is was written adds much to the paper and I think the whole section dealing with how the policy principles were developed etc. could be deleted without loss. I also fear that some readers will put it aside because they are not interested in a specific Canadian / Ontario angle without realising that it is really a very general review.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

In the abstract results section the authors write "... the literature suggests that there is no single best approach to create incentives YET...". Do they really believe that there will ever be a single best approach as the "yet" implies?

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:  
I declare that I have no competing interests