Reviewer's report

Title: Quality of Medical Training and Emigration of Physicians from India: an observational study

Version: 2 Date: 18 August 2008

Reviewer: Danette McKinley

Reviewer's report:

I believe that the authors missed a couple of relevant references. For more recent presentation on the quality of migrating physicians, see Boulet et al., The international medical graduate pipeline: recent trends in certification and residency training. Health Affairs 2006 Mar-Apr;25(2):469-77.

Also, there have been other papers that are related to this, although focused on the migration of African physicians:


The authors do not adequately state the challenges of developing quality indicators for the private medical colleges, although there is an assumption that they are of lesser quality. Since, for the most part, they used the mean of the university with which the medical school was affiliated, this was probably of little effect.

Also, the authors discuss the possibility of developing high-quality research and policy institutions, but does it appear from the available data that these are areas pursued by migrating physicians (i.e., in the recipient country)?


Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.