Author's response to reviews

Title: A study of the number of physicians registered in Jamaica and their countries of training.

Authors:

Jennifer M Knight-Madden (jennifer_knight@yahoo.com)

Version: 3 Date: 21 October 2008

Author's response to reviews:

Sickle Cell Unit
Tropical Medicine Research Institute
University of the West Indies
Kingston 7
Jamaica
17/10/2008

Dr. Mark Todd
Assistant Editor
BMC –series journals

Dear Dr. Todd,

Re: MS: 2000599681888038
A study of the number of physicians registered in Jamaica and their countries of training.

Thank you for the helpful comments from the reviewers. We have revised the manuscript. It is now entitled ‘The accuracy of the Jamaican national physician register: A study of the status of physicians registered and their countries of training’.

I have responded to all the detailed comments by the reviewers. The responses are included below.

I have not been able to have the manuscript professionally copyedited, but have reviewed it with assistance from a colleague.

The paper has been reformatted.

I hope the manuscript is now acceptable for publication, even if further editing is required.
Sincerely,

Jennifer Knight-Madden Robert Gray

MS: 200599681888038
A study of the number of physicians registered in Jamaica and their countries of training.
Jennifer M Knight-Madden

Responses to Reviewers' comments

Reviewer 2: Amy Hagopian

- The title has been amended to include a colon.
- The density is now uniformly quoted as # physicians/10,000 population.
- “which” has been replace by “that”.
- UHWI has been defined when first used.
- The sentence beginning “While facilitating… “has been removed.
- The word “local” has been replaced by “Jamaican”.
- The tables and figures are referenced in the text.
- The spelling of Professor Gray’s name has been corrected.
- The sentences which includes “many appropriately qualified…” , “ascertaining this information” and “this report” have been deleted.
- The use of “must be” and “should be” have been amended.
- The date format has been changed.
- Fewer replaces less.
- The deadline for registration is clearly stated.
- Several calls and e-mails were sent to the Regional Health Authorities. I didn’t ask Professor Gray to assist with communicating with them.
- The sentence dealing with cost of education has been deleted.
- I have amended Figure 2 and the text to facilitate my calculations to be duplicated. I have removed the calculation of a physician density based on the sub-sample from the results section. It is now solely in the discussion and the non-representative nature of the sub-sample is acknowledged.
- I have adjusted the conclusion so that it doesn’t speak to a significant underestimate of the physician density.
- Thank you. I have included the references and found them to be interesting reading.
- The legends are included at the end of the text as required by the “instructions to authors”. I am not sure how/where to include caption since the legends are to
be included in the text rather than with the figure. I have included the caption with
the legend.
- The title for the table has been amended.
- Professor Gray has significantly improved the quality of written English.

MS: 2000599681888038
A study of the number of physicians registered in Jamaica and their
countries of training.
Jennifer M Knight-Madden

Responses to Reviewers’ comments

Reviewer 3: Affette McCaw-Binns

- The use of significantly to describe the estimated physician density has been abandoned.
- I have suggested that perhaps the MCJ’s mandate may be widened to include
the registration of specialists
- Barbados and Trinidad have been omitted from page 5.
- There are now separate paragraphs dealing with the UWI and the aims of the study
- The issue of full economic cost has been deleted.
- “Currently practicing” is clearly defined.
- The physician density is described as an indicator of access to health care.
- Figure 2 is now referenced in the text.
- The population for 2005 is now used instead of that for 2001.
- Professor Gray, having contributed significantly to the manuscript, is now
included as an author.
- Professor Gray has significantly improved the quality of written English.