Reviewer's report

Title: A predictive score to identify hospitalized patients requiring discharge to a post-acute care facility

Version: 1 Date: 14 September 2007

Reviewer: Robert L Kane

Reviewer's report:

General
This study uses a sample from a general medicine ward. Prior studies have used populations with higher risk of post-acute care. The sample will affect the level of detection and discrimination. The study does not distinguish PAC at home from in an institution.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
The authors need to make clear the nature of their sample and its implications for the results. They are discriminating often among young and old patients. The study does not distinguish post-acute care at home from in an institution.
Whats was the basis for assigning points? (p8)
The discussion should address why cognition was not more significant. Why does age drop out? Would the results differ if you used age groups instead of years.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
Table 1: It seems strange to see so little difference MMSE scores
Table 2: What would happen if you used age groups? Is there a bias in bathing in hospitals?

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
What were the contributions of the other authors?
p 2: "...area under the curve receiver..."
p 4: "lived prior to hospital admission"

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions
**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

no conflicts