Reviewer’s report

Title: Does delayed measurement effect patient reports of provider performance? implications for performance measurement of medical assistance with tobacco cessation: A Dental PBRN study

Version: 2 Date: 17 March 2008

Reviewer: Catherine Dube

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

This paper is improved but still has some problems. Please see last review for positive comments, which still apply to this article.

1. Be consistent in how you refer to the practices for THIS study – you have 60 practices, they are neither intervention nor control in THIS study. On page 4 they are referred to in one place as 60 intervention and control, and another place as 60 no-intervention (control). They are neither -- they are 60 practices who were originally recruited for another study.

2. SEPARATE your discussion of the original study and THIS study. On page 4 you say that “We conducted a randomized trial” – this may be true of the study from which the practices were recruited, but not for THIS study that you are reporting on. This is confusing.

3. Figure 1 is confusing and does not add to the importance of your findings. What this study is about is the inconsistency of self-report, immediate compared to later in time. This is an important issue – what how the changes in self-report differed by practice is not so important. One would think that practice factors would not influence recall. However, if insist on keeping this in I would suggest that, instead of figure 1, provide a table showing how practice percentiles changed and which changes were significant.

4. The sentence on page 7 starting with “Thus for ‘ask’ patients” makes no sense.

Minor Essential Revisions

None

Discretionary Revisions

None

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions
Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.