Reviewer's report

Title: The Internet for weight control in an obese sample: results of a randomised controlled trial

Version: 3 Date: 16 July 2007

Reviewer: Andrew R Willan

Reviewer's report:

General

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

A cost-effectiveness acceptability curve should be added.

Table 1 should be repeated (with statistical comparisons) for the patients with complete follow-up data, and should include age, sex and the "confidence" score.

The primary analysis should be an ANOCOVA with weight at 12 months as the independent variable and the following variables as dependent: treatment indicator, baseline weight, age, sex, baseline confidence, baseline physical activity.

A much fuller discussion of the limitation imposed by the high attrition rates should be added.

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

The sensitivity analysis should be removed. There is a large literature showing that these types of analyses are inappropriate.

To account for missing follow-up a proper multi-imputation analysis should be considered using all the dependent variables listed above.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely
related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests,