Reviewer's report

Title: Payer leverage and hospital compliance with a benchmark: A population-based observational study

Version: 2 Date: 6 June 2007

Reviewer: Vivian Ho

Reviewer's report:

General

This is an excellent revision of the manuscript.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

Although the authors claim that Medicare links its minimum volume standards to reimbursement, it seems that hospitals continue to get reimbursed by Medicare for transplants even when they fall below minimum volume requirements. It would be helpful to the reader to clarify this issue. In reality, are hospitals that perform few transplants concerned that they will lose Medicare coverage? Is there any evidence suggesting that CMS will withdraw reimbursement for low-volume providers in the near future?

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.