Reviewer's report

Title: The cost-effectiveness of early noninvasive ventilation for ALS patients.

Version: 1 Date: 14 June 2005

Reviewer: Noah Lechtzin

Reviewer's report:

General

Dr. Gruis and colleagues report the findings from a cost effectiveness analysis of NIPPV at the time of ALS diagnosis. This is done to determine the usefulness and feasibility of future studies of early use of NIPPV. This is a novel approach to this question. The study is well designed. Like any cost effectiveness analysis, it depends on many assumptions. While this is always a potential limitation, the authors based their assumptions on reasonable values from appropriate literature and performed sensitivity analyses to allow for a wide range of values for NIPPV tolerability and effectiveness. The study shows convincingly that NIPPV has a good likelihood of being cost effective if it does improve quality of life early in the course of ALS.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

None.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

None.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

None.

What next?: Accept without revision

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.