Reviewer's report

**Title:** The experience of Community First Responders in co-producing rural health care: in the liminal gap between citizen and professional

**Version:** 2  **Date:** 18 May 2014

**Reviewer:** Stephen Timmons

**Reviewer's report:**

Is the question posed by the authors well defined?
Yes

2. Are the methods appropriate and well described?
Yes

3. Are the data sound?
Yes

4. Does the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition?
Yes

5. Are the discussion and conclusions well balanced and adequately supported by the data?
Yes

6. Are limitations of the work clearly stated?
Yes

7. Do the authors clearly acknowledge any work upon which they are building, both published and unpublished?
Yes

8. Do the title and abstract accurately convey what has been found?
Yes

9. Is the writing acceptable?
Yes

**Major Compulsory Revisions**

- The theoretical framework, such as the notions of liminality, communitas, and co-production, based on the work of Turner, should be outlined in the literature review, and not introduced and defined in the discussion (p19)
- P5 clarify that some schemes were established by SAS, and others
autonomously by the local community


And: Do bystanders need follow-up after performing CPR? Wenche Torunn Mathiesen, Conrad A. Bjørshol, Eldar Søreide. Resuscitation Volume 85, Supplement 1, S1-S122

May 2014

P6 explain the concept of co-production in a bit more detail

Minor issues not for publication

P4 – ‘in an Australian community’ [26] described’ needs the name of the author(s)

P4 – ‘the English report’ – should be the Healthcare Commission report

P5 ‘it is light’ rephrase

P10 – please don’t say ‘impact on’; rephrase

P11 ‘ providing basics support’ – do you mean basic ? or BASICS ?

P16 ‘ we don’t want you to volunteer any’ – is the word ‘more’ missing ?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests