Reviewer’s report

Title: The impact of preoperative patient characteristics on the cost-effectiveness of total hip replacement: a cohort study

Version: 3 Date: 16 June 2014

Reviewer: James Gaughan

Reviewer’s report:

The authors have responded clearly to my comments about the previous submission. I consider that all of these have now been answered. The additional comments set out below seek clarification about the data and are to ensure this is fully represented. I recommend acceptance, subject to these points being answered.

Major Compulsory Revisions

Table 1(2) – While the total sample is 292, some of the groups of categories in this table don’t sum to that figure. The categories of previous joint procedures add up to 291, marital status to 289, housing situation to 288 and Charlson score to 291. If this is a typographical error, please correct. If it reflects missing data then the observations should be dropped throughout, or the missing data imputed, or a robustness check is needed to show that dropping these observations, when using the final specifications, does not significantly alter the results. Whichever approach is used needs also to be justified in the manuscript as appropriate.

Minor Essential Revisions

Table 2 – Similarly to table 1, the totals given in this table do not all reflect the sum of their respective columns (5) or rows (4). These are generally very small differences that look like arithmetic errors but please recheck the figures in the table are accurate and totals reflect the values. If the differences are due to rounding error or something similar, please add a footnote to this effect.

Table 3 – Please add the number of observations with each model or as a footnote to the table.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.