Reviewer's report

Title: Integration of rural and urban medical insurance schemes in China: an empirical research

Version: 2 Date: 30 March 2013

Reviewer: Sarah Barber

Reviewer's report:

The author(s) carry out a study in 4 regions (Changshu, Shenyang, Foshan, and Changchun), by issuing a questionnaire. It seems that the purpose is to assess resident expectations and satisfactions with premium payment levels.

Major compulsory revisions

1. There is no clear research question stated up front, nor is the purpose of the study in the abstract. Thus the paper is not systematic in its approach and presentation.

2. The format of the paper should be streamlined. At present, the discussion of the study only starts on page 13, after a very long series of discussions on "coordinated cohesion." The background and theoretical rationale should be summarized within 1-2 pages.

3. The empirical study description starts on page 13, but the authors jump immediately into the administration of the questionnaire. Some basics in terms of the methods seem to be missing. I would suggest starting out with a clear research question (it is now is somewhat lost in the background, and could be more clearly spelled out.) In addition, missing is the design of the survey (who did it, was it validated), key outcome variables under study, how are they defined, etc.

4. The definition of the variables and the results are described in one section. It is suggested that the methods be pulled out and placed in a separate section, and the results would be presented separately.

5. The policy suggestions are somewhat prescriptive and appear to go well beyond the descriptive findings in the study. It is suggested that the author's limit their paper to the findings in the study, and perhaps make recommendations on policy evaluations for future study.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a
statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

none