Reviewer's report

Title: Politics and its intersection with coverage with evidence development:: a qualitative analysis from expert interviews

Version: 1 Date: 2 December 2012

Reviewer: peter littlejohns

Reviewer's report:

Major

1. I am not sure when the authors refer to politics they mean politics (here I mean negotiations between stakeholders) or Politics (the way the national system is governed). I suspect that they are referring to both but this should be clarified as the solutions are different.

2. Their definition of Coverage with Evidence and how the term has evolved needs more attention "CED is an umbrella term for institutions and policy think tanks to capture the essence of various evidence development approaches." is not sufficient. There are papers that they could refer to on this. They do mention the HTAi review but there are also other examples.

Evidence-Based Decision Making: When Should We Wait For More Information? Kalipso Chalkidou, Joanne Lord, Alastair Fischer and Peter Littlejohns
Health Affairs. 2008 27 No 6 1642-1653
http://content.healthaffairs.org/content/27/6/1642.full

Informing a decision framework for when NICE should recommend the use of health technologies only in the context of an appropriately designed programme of evidence development K Claxton, S Palmer, L Longworth, L Bojke, S Griffin, C McKenna, M Soares, E Spackman and I Youn Health Technol Assess 2012;16(46):1–323

3. The methodology that is used while known by some researchers will not be well known to many interested in this paper and therefore its validity should be explained in more detail.

Minor

1. They refer to "numerous studies and varieties of CED approaches applied to drug coverage programs since 1995" but I would dispute this - relevant to other forms of data collection there have been relatively few.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published.

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.