Reviewer’s report

**Title:** Implementation of geriatric assessment and decision support as part of a Multidisciplinary Integrated Care model in residential care homes

**Version:** 5  **Date:** 26 October 2012

**Reviewer:** Jane Banaszak-Holl

Reviewer’s report:

In this second revision of this paper on implementing a new geriatric assessment tool, the authors have substantially improved the manuscript based on reviewers’ comments and I have only a few additional and minor comments to add. The paper could still benefit from additional editing of a number of sentences that are awkward in the use of English grammar (writing is acceptable but could still be improved).

**ESSENTIAL REVISIONS**

Description of methods: Furthermore, while a figure describing stages of the research is important for the reader to help follow the flow of findings, it does not make sense that Figure 1 focuses on the number of residents recruited and included in the study because none of the paper’s findings are based on data from resident questions. Resident outcomes are used only peripherally to identify successful or non-successful facilities. I recommend restructuring Figure 1 to identify how staff and managers, instead of residents, were incorporated in the project at each stage. Also, not all the labels in figure 1 were readable in the copy I had.

**DISCRETIONARY REVISIONS**

Discussion and conclusions: Conclusions could be stated more strongly and in particular, wording “were comparable” in first sentence is not sufficiently clear. Also, link conclusions back to the initial use of the Grimshaw model as discussed in the introduction. Is it expected or not that the facilitators and barriers were the same in the initial and continuing phases of implementation?

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.