Reviewer's report

Title: The needs of people with dementia living at home: user, carer and professional perspectives

Version: 3 Date: 7 June 2012

Reviewer: Gail Anne Mountain

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions
The authors have responded to most of the requirements I previously identified and the manuscript is much improved. The consenting process is now adequately described and the profile of participants has been tabulated. The numbers available for analysis is clarified.
The discussion has been extended, largely by referring to an unpublished study by the first author. This has added a cultural context which was not there previously and was not mentioned in the introduction. There is other published literature on identification of the needs of people with dementia and carers which it would be appropriate to refer to. Using an unpublished study is not appropriate. It is also not relevant to compare with needs identified in Chile as this was not the stated aim at the outset. Therefore it is necessary to revisit the discussion. The authors need to be clear regarding what the discussion section is trying to convey and identify other literature that refutes or confirms the findings of this study. Also, some of the references to other work currently in the discussion would be better placed in the introduction.

Minor Essential Revisions
The manuscript has been edited to improve use of English, but I do suggest that this is done once more as a few errors remain.
The explanation of the measure needs to go before the section on data analysis
Some of the explanation of socio demographic profile of participants could now be removed from the text as it has been tabulated.

Discretionary Revisions
I still recommend a fuller review of the literature in the introduction

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests