Reviewer’s report

Title: Practicing provider-initiated HIV testing in high prevalence settings: Consent concerns and missed preventive opportunities

Version: 3 Date: 2 February 2011

Reviewer: Omotayo Bolu

Reviewer’s report:

The authors have revised the paper. However, I still have some concerns or comments:

1. The use of the word threat several times in the paper may be an over exaggeration of the interpretation of the quotes. The quotes seemed to favor a concern that clients have about not spending enough time with counseling them. I will recommend tampering that down as well as the word "forceful or substantial frustration" The quotes really appear more like a concern than many of these adjectives in the abstract and the main text of the paper.

2. I will recommend a limitation section: and list under this section, that having only the Malinda data alone could be biased and non representative of other countries or other districts (similar to what you already stated). Second, the quote from the female outpatient /ANC in Kapiri Mposhi clearly says they were given the information pre and post test. So it’s hard to accept that the results will be similar. Also, do authors know if all PMTCT services received by respondents were from one clinic in urban and one clinic in rural/ semi urban in Malinda or several different clinics? It will be helpful to add age of respondents in quote so that readers know these are very different women from different parts of the district. Third limitation is that many of the quotes are based on perception and ideas of what people want or feel should be done, without much experience by participants (except for the male tested at VCT from urban Malindi), and most others are based on will be difficult to interpreted

3. Another suggestion for discussion, is to recommend the use of lay counselors to supplement health care workers who offer several other services and test for the pregnant woman including Hb test, chemistry, STI, urine, etc for the pregnant woman and HIV just happens to be one of the interventions that we can offer services to if found to be positive. Thus considering the work load, the use of lay counselors is being done successfully in Botswana.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests