Reviewer's report

Title: Integrating intensified case finding of tuberculosis into HIV care: an evaluation from rural Swaziland.

Version: 1 Date: 13 November 2010

Reviewer: Ikushi Onozaki

Reviewer's report:

This short paper suggests that small efforts of symptom screening in HIV service may have a potential to facilitate early case detection of TB.

I would like the authors considering following points:

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. The authors misunderstand the definition of "case detection rate". CDR is defined as proportion of detected case among incident cases. Proportion of TB patients among screened is not the case detection rate.

2. It is not clear if this paper is discussing prevalence or incidence of TB among observed HIV positive (PHW). It is necessary to classify screening/detected cases to i) newly recruited PWH and ii) PWH already in the service. Many studies showed higher yield by the 1st screening or screening at the recruitment (high TB prevalence when they are detected as HIV positive). Rather low TB detection (2% among those screened) in this study might be due to higher proportion of follow up cases (known PWH) and very short observation period.

Minor Essential Revision

3. High drop out in the screening and diagnostic process is a great concern. The authors have not shown if they dropped out from the HIV follow up service itself or simply from the TB screening and diagnostic process. Please clarify.

4. Purpose of the analysis in table 1 is not clear without comparison between TB patients and non-TB patients.

Discretionary revision

5. Age sex adjusted expected number of TB case detection among this 1467 HIV patients could be calculated from routine surveillance data. It may tell if this intensified screening programme could detect TB cases more than routine programme or not, although small sample size and very short observation period is concerned.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being
published

**Statistical review:** Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests below.