Reviewer's report

Title: Doctor as Criminal: Reporting of Patient Deaths to the Police and Criminal Prosecution of Healthcare Providers in Japan

Version: 2 Date: 29 December 2009

Reviewer: Michael Green

Reviewer's report:


Submitted by:
Michael E Green, MD, MPH, CCFP
Associate Professor, Depts of Family Medicine and Community Health and Epidemiology, Queen’s University

General Comments:

Interesting report on the use of criminal prosecutions (as opposed to civil litigation) as the legal avenue for dealing with deaths due to medical error. This article will be of interest to researchers and policy makers with an interest in medical error, medical malpractice and patient safety.

The revisions that have been made are appropriate. While they maintained their initial analytic approach the discussion address my initial concerns on the first draft of the paper. The suggested revisions made to address comments of the other reviewers also improve the paper.

Major Compulsory Revisions: None
Minor Revisions: None now.

Recommendation: Accept.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare I have no competing interests.