Reviewer's report

**Title:** Doctor as Criminal: Reporting of Patient Deaths to the Police and Criminal Prosecution of Healthcare Providers in Japan

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 23 October 2009

**Reviewer:** Toru Hiyama

**Reviewer's report:**

This is an interesting research that indicates present status of reporting of patient deaths to the police and criminal prosecution of healthcare providers in Japan. However, following point should be addressed.

The authors described, “While we do not know why, we speculate it is most likely physicians are reporting more to comply with the law. “ in the 3rd paragraph of the Discussion section. As the authors in the Introduction section, the director of Hiroo General Hospital was prosecuted, found guilty, and imposed criminal sanctions. It is often said that to avoid criminal sanctions, physicians have got to report of patient deaths to the police. The authors should comment on this point.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.