Reviewer's report

Title: The effect of the COACH program (Continuity Of Appropriate pharmacotherapy, patient Counselling and information transfer in Healthcare) on readmission rates in a multicultural population of internal medicine patients

Version: 2 Date: 11 December 2009

Reviewer: Dan Berlowitz

Reviewer's report:

Issues with power have not been satisfactorily addressed. The investigators appear to have made a mistake in terms of differentiating absolute vs relative reductions. They report that studies have shown reductions of 18-47% as a result of similar interventions. These almost certainly are relative (a 50% decline means that the rate is halved not that it went from 60% to 10% readmission rates). The authors then go on to say their estimate is conservative in that reducing the rate from 25% to 15% represents a 10% reduction which is less than these other studies. However, this 10% absolute reduction represents a 40% risk reduction which is hardly conservative.

The timeline of the study shown in the figure also needs to be updated (unless the study is already underway). This timeline suggests that the intervention is to be implemented in 10/09.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests