Reviewer’s report

Title: Conceptual and practical challenges for implementing the communities of practice model on a national scale: a Canadian cancer control initiative

Version: 1 Date: 17 June 2009

Reviewer: Nicola Andrew

Reviewer’s report:

This article is interesting, well written and engages the reader from the outset. The content serves to further demonstrate the use of CoPs as a viable tool for the generation and transfer of health knowledge and promotion of clinical leadership. The research into the use of CoPs as a tool for healthcare practice and innovation has expanded over the past five-ten years, from a point when it was a virtually unknown business/organisational development based concept, to present day status where it is now commonly used (and at times perhaps overused) terminology in health care education and practice. I think that this article does add to the body of knowledge around the use and purpose of CoPs in health care however it is mainly presented as a critique of this approach and not, as the current title suggests, the specific implementation of the CPAC CoP which really is only represented by a couple of paragraphs at the end of the piece.

I would advise a re-visitation of the end section perhaps to provide additional material around the specifics of the CPAC CoP as this is likely to increase both educational and discipline specific readership. I think currently this article is a good critique of CoPs generally and Wenger specifically (and there are quite a lot of these already in the literature), however the inclusion and expansion of case studies and examples from practice really will really lift the work from its current status, enhance the quality if the piece and potentially engage a wider audience as a result.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests