Reviewer's report

Title: Home based music therapy - A review of conditions, settings and indications for an innovative field of health service.

Version: 2 Date: 31 July 2010

Reviewer: Felicity Baker

Reviewer's report:

1) Overall assessment:
This is an important study which I hope will be published once a few minor details have been addressed. The methodological approach is very well articulate, clear progression, an independent repeat of their procedures would be likely to generate fairly similar results. Data are sound.

2) Major Essential Revisions
   a) The authors present an important overview of the literature however they could pose the question a little bit more clearly. The word “indication” doesn’t seem to actually best represent what the authors are trying to establish with their review.
   b) One aspect I’d like the authors to consider is that they don’t present a very strong argument for why this review is important. I think it is based on my own knowledge, but this doesn’t come through in the article. Be stronger in arguing for the value of this review. Also see my comments re discussion section which relates to this point as well.
   c) Generally the discussion is well put together however I would like to see a further discussion of any recommendations they could propose based on their findings – this could be directed towards music therapists and/or health-care providers. I.e., what is the point of doing this unless some recommendations for future practice/research etc are more clearly discussed.
   d) Limitations of the study are absent from this review. I consider this important in systematic literature reviews. Eg what about articles in foreign languages, much data might be missing eg Japan is well known for publishing outcome based studies. There might be research missed there.
   e) The writing is generally acceptable. There are a number of “German” English sentence structures which need to be addressed, specifically the sentences that begin “Especially…” which are frequently used.
   f) -Also p.4, beginning of final paragraph “On this background…” please attend to this sentence.
   g) -P. 5, last sentence before Methods section begins. “Therefore it is of interest…” please revise this.
   h) -P. 6 “pre-especially designed data form” what about “a pre-determined
checklist” or “specially designed data checklist” or something like this.
i) -P.11, first sentence of “discussion”. Please revise English expression

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests