Reviewer's report

Title: A comparison of the Charlson comorbidity index derived from medical records and claims data in patients undergoing lung cancer surgery in Korea: a population based investigation

Version: 1 Date: 2 June 2010

Reviewer: Leslie Roos

Reviewer's report:

Minor Essential Revisions:
1) Would be very useful to have manuscript corrected by someone whose native language is English (a most idiosyncratic language!)
2) Would like to see more discussion (speculation?) as to the reasons for poor agreement. Are the cases used particularly difficult to code because of the severity of the primary diagnosis? Are the hospitals studied unusual in any way?
3) Expand discussion of data collection somewhat, given the pessimistic results.

A useful contribution which needs a little more work.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.