Reviewer’s report

Title: A comparison of the Charlson comorbidity index derived from medical records and claims data in patients undergoing lung cancer surgery in Korea: a population based investigation

Version: 1 Date: 1 June 2010

Reviewer: Han-Shui Hsu

Reviewer’s report:

The authors aim to study if there is agreement between the Charlson comorbidity index (CCI) calculated from medical record and from claims data in a group of lung cancer patients. They concluded that the consistency of the medical records and claims data is not excellent and both CCI scores could not be used to predict the length of stay and reimbursement cost. Overall, this is a study with negative results. There are some major problems in this article. First, the patient group in this study is heterogeneous, including stage I-III patients of lung cancer who had different severity of disease and received different types of resection. Secondly, the data collected are inconsistent and inaccurate, that made the data difficult to interpret and somewhat unreliable.

Additional minor comments,

1. Some clinical information of patients like smoking status and adjuvant chemotherapy or radiotherapy after surgery is missing.
2. In Methods, why were 69 patients excluded from the analysis? The authors mentioned that these patients were excluded from the analysis due to the difference between preoperative and postoperative staging and inaccurate postoperative staging. What does the inaccurate postoperative staging indicate? Were these 69 patients diagnosed to be stage IV disease after operations?
3. What is the percentage of surgical mortality in these patients? Would the CCI score affect operative mortality or 30-day mortality?
4. Some typographic errors existed in Results section (Results resection 3rd paragraph line 14 and paragraph 4th, line 9)

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.