Reviewer's report

Title: The Effects of Long-Term Total Parenteral Nutrition on Gut Mucosal Immunity in Children with Short Bowel Syndrome: A Systematic Review

Version: 6 Date: 30 August 2004

Reviewer: David Sigalet

Reviewer's report:

General
This is a much improved version of the article. The author has expanded the scope of the review and the discussion. It now contains a great deal of background material on intestinal function, physiology, and the adaptive process from a variety of animal and human studies. This is used to effectively bolster the discussion of the human studies regarding the effects of TPN in infants with SBS. This now represents a significant contribution to the literature.

---------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

---------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

multiple minor spelling and grammatical errors: eg abstract pge 3, second line "there is no enough evidence"
pge 4 second para, line 3, have investigated indicate....
pge 6 para 1, ? definition of translocation should include permeation of mucosal barrier, which may or may not result in infection in regional/distant lymph nodes, ie some translocation may be normal?
pge 7, last para, After surgical intervention, the sympathetic response...
Next line, remove "The" from Following injury,....
pge 9, para 1, role of glutamine in human gut function is still not well established, many people think that it is more important in the rat, than in man.
pge 10, end of first para ...permeability "caused".
Pge 11: cytokines have already been discussed.
pge 14, this is rediscussion, but reads better than the first part about gut function. para 2.. the driving force is antigen, ..?
Pge 36: ? expand further the implications for nursing practise.

---------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No
Declaration of competing interests:

none