Reviewer’s report

Title: The influence of relationships on personhood in dementia care: A qualitative, hermeneutic study

Version: 1 Date: 31 May 2013

Reviewer: Juanita Hoe

Reviewer’s report:

The influence of relationships on personhood in dementia care: A qualitative, hermeneutic study

Discretionary Revisions

1. Understanding personhood is complex and it can be a very difficult topic to write about coherently. This paper provides a very articulate and comprehensive introduction to the topic which sets the context for the study. The methods and analysis are appropriate and clearly described, and the results section is well structured. The examples given clearly describe how positive and negative approaches towards care and attitude impact on personhood. These findings are revealing and do demonstrate the influence of relationships on personhood in dementia and whether person centred care is provided.

2. I would suggest that the last sentence in Case Miss H (Results: Unprofessional relationships: 3rd paragraph) is amended to:

Miss H was not given the opportunity to communicate adequately and combining toileting with taking care of personal hygiene was most likely seen as an efficient way of getting through morning care. This activity clearly diminishes personhood and is considered an unacceptable way of delivering personal care.

(The authors may prefer to leave out the last sentence and I leave this to their judgement - Minor issues not for publication).

3. The discussion acknowledges that the sample is small and cannot be generalised, but the findings are of interest and the conclusions drawn are well balanced and adequately supported by the data. I particularly found the distinction between individualised and person centred care informative.

4. The paper is generally well written and clear. There are some minor grammatical errors, which could be corrected with further editing by the authors e.g: in the recruitment and sample section, it may be preferable to use the word ‘people’ rather than ‘persons’. (Minor issues not for publication) interest

5. Understanding the influence of relationships in dementia is helpful in increasing awareness and recognition of their impact on the care provided. Overall, this is a very interesting and important paper that builds on the current literature around personhood and person-centred care and the authors are to be
commended on a very worthwhile study.

**Level of interest:** An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests