Reviewer's report

Title: Do knowledge, knowledge sources and reasoning skills affect the accuracy of nursing diagnoses? A randomised study.

Version: 2 Date: 29 May 2012

Reviewer: Daniel Pesut

Reviewer's report:

As the article was framed related to the use of knowledge resources for structuring and deriving nursing diagnoses -- the research does this...however, it could be noted identification of a diagnosis is really only one aspect of the clinical reasoning process nurses engage. What about the interventions and outcomes of the clinical reasoning process? Identification of problems using knowledge resources is really a very small slice of a much more complex process. I do realize there is controversy in some parts of the world about the use of nursing diagnoses and this research does add information and knowledge about the value of the PES structure in the identification of nursing diagnoses as far as the authors have defined and delimited the nature of the study.

There could be more discussion about the role of reasoning skills in the identification of nursing diagnoses. While the authors discuss the role of induction and deduction -- clinical reasoning also involves some abduction... and there was little discussion of this... in the article as framed and presented.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.