Reviewer's report

Title: Locating previously unknown patterns in data-mining results: a dual data- and knowledge-mining method

Version: 2 Date: 8 September 2005

Reviewer: Bing Liu

Reviewer's report:

General

The authors studied an useful problem to deal with too many patterns. The idea of using two sources are interesting, but not new. The advance is minor. It appears that the authors are not aware of a lot of work on the topic in the data mining community, where the problem is called subjective relevance or interestingness. There are a series of papers on the topic from many researchers in KDD conferences. You can start by checking out the work by Bing Liu's group and Alex Tuzhilin's group, and many others. Without good comparison, it is hard to justify your progress.

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Compare with those works mentioned above and others in terms of ideas and results.

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Reject because too small an advance to publish

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

No to all.