Reviewer's report

Title: GPs' decisions on drug treatment for patients with high cholesterol values: A think-aloud study

Version: 2 Date: 4 October 2004

Reviewer: Robert Wigton

Reviewer's report:

General
This paper reports the results of analysis of the coding of remarks of 20 GPs recorded as they work through 6 case vignettes and decide whether or not to prescribe drug treatment to reduce cholesterol. The design and coding of the "think aloud" protocol is innovative. The study, thought complicated, is clearly written. Their finding that clinical information (such as body weight) may be used in completely opposite ways by different practitioners in deciding to prescribe is important and deserves further study.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept without revision

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

none