Reviewer's report

Title: A computer decision aid for medical prevention: a pilot qualitative study of the Personalized Estimate of Risks (EsPeR) system.

Authors:

Dr Isabelle Colombet (isabelle.colombet@spim.jussieu.fr)
Thierry Dart (thierry.dart@spim.jussieu.fr)
Laurence Leneveut (laurence.leneveut@wanadoo.fr)
Sylvain Zunino (sylvain.zunino@spim.jussieu.fr)
Joel Menard (joel.menard@spim.jussieu.fr)
Gilles Chatellier (gilles.chatellier@spim.jussieu.fr)

Version: 1 Date: 17 Jul 2003

Reviewer: John Fox

Level of interest: A paper whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Advice on publication: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the compulsory revisions

1. The research methods employed seem to be in accordance with this type of study, but there isn't enough information in the paper to bridge between the depicted methods and the resulting conclusions.
2. A more detailed description of the research methods would be beneficial, as would a more comprehensive account of the transformation of the raw data into manageable results.
3. The Results section itself is more of a Discussion section: It provides a summary of the authors' conclusions from the evaluation, but does not provide an actual description of the data, except for a few incidental examples.
4. Finally, in the Discussion section some new inferences are introduced, for which the basis remains unclear.
5. Table 2 is difficult to read.
6. The whole paper is difficult to read and should be reviewed by a native English speaker or other experienced author.

Discretionary clarifications

1. There are some deviations from standard scientific writing, e.g., description of participants in the Results section.
2. At the beginning of the Discussion section the system is described as "devoted to the prevention of cardiovascular diseases and cancer", but from other sections it appears to be devoted to other diseases as well.

Competing interests:

None declared.