Reviewer's report

Title: The SAKK Cancer-Specific Geriatric Assessment (C-SGA): A pilot study of a brief tool for clinical decision-making in older cancer patients

Version: 2 Date: 2 June 2013

Reviewer: Martine Extermann

Reviewer's report:

This manuscript evaluates feasibility of the SAKK-SGA. Feasibility is well demonstrated. However another point remains to be corrected:

1) Major: The authors claim their score is discriminative. However, their statistical analysis shows correlation with other health parameters, not discrimination. In order to claim discriminative ability, they should demonstrate that their threshold for treatment feasibility does indeed identify correctly patients who could or could not tolerate standard treatment. Please modify the discussion from discrimination to correlation or provide data supporting for the former.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interest.