Reviewer's report

Title: Health Research Ethics Committees in South Africa 12 years into democracy

Version: 3 Date: 13 July 2006

Reviewer: Udo Schuklenk

Reviewer's report:

I advise to reject this manuscript. The authors do not seem to have a reasonable understanding of concepts they use liberally. 'Community representation' is a case in point. Their claim that this concept hasn't been researched empirically in South Africa is irrelevant as my concerns are of a conceptual not empirical nature. Given the authors' failure to appreciate the importance of analytical clarity with regard to the concepts employed, it is not advisable to publish this manuscript.

What next?: Reject because scientifically unsound

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests.