Reviewer's report

Title: Human Dignity in the Nazi Era: Implications for Contemporary Bioethics

Version: 1 Date: 18 November 2005

Reviewer: Christopher Hook

Reviewer's report:

General The piece by Dr. O'Mathuna is an important reminder of pertinent past issues that have a
direct relevance to contemporary bioethical, medical and biotechnological issues. I believe the
article should be published.

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can
be reached)

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the
author can be trusted to correct)
There is need for an editorial overview. Occasional grammar and sentence structure is awkward
throughout the piece.

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
An excellent contemporary example of his concerns, not cited by the author, is the work by
Buchanan, Brock, Wikler and Daniels, From Chance to Choice, in which they unabashedly resurrect
the concept of the lebensverten leben, "lives unworthy of living". Additionally there are statements
from other luminaries such as James Watson, Linus Pauling and Joshua Lederberg all espousing
the same ideals as Peter Singer, and the historical eugenicists, let alone the nazi's. These additions
would strengthen the author's contention of the need for careful remembrance of what has gone
before and how it applies to today.

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.