Author's response to reviews

Title: Top 10 Health Care Ethics Challenges Facing the Public: Views of Toronto Bioethicists

Authors:

Jonathan M Breslin (jonathan.breslin@utoronto.ca)
Susan K MacRae (sue.macrae@utoronto.ca)
Jennifer Bell (jah.bell@utoronto.ca)
Peter A Singer (peter.singer@utoronto.ca)

Version: 3 Date: 19 May 2005

Author's response to reviews:

We have changed the format of the paper to the debate format as requested by the Editor. Also, we have clarified details of the Delphi process as per Reviewer 2's comments. However, we respectfully disagree with the remaining comments from Reviewer 1 (Karine Morin). We believe that we have adequately addressed her initial concerns, especially with the expansion of the "Limitations" section and the revisions to what was originally the "Methods" section of the paper. We recognize and accept that our study was not a traditional Delphi and that there are limitations to the generalizability of the results. But that doesn't change the fact that a panel of Toronto bioethicists did rank their top ten ethical challenges, and the discussion is based entirely on this ranking. This is also why, as we stated previously, we included minimal references in the discussion - most of the content of the discussion was based on the comments from the panel members and are not factual claims. We included additional references where factual claims have been made in the previous revision. Although we agree that a paper focusing on a more detailed action plan to address the top challenge would be informative, that was not the purpose of this paper. Therefore, we believe that we have adequately incorporated the comments from the reviewers into the paper.